



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

May 24, 2024

**PETITION SHEETS SHOWING CLEAR INDICATIONS OF FRAUD**

**I. Introduction**

This memorandum describes review by Bureau of Elections (Bureau) staff of nominating petitions submitted for the August 6, 2024, primary election, that included sheets showing clear indications of fraud.

Following the 2022 election cycle, in which circulators submitted at least 68,000 signatures across 10 sets of nominating petitions, where the submissions consisted entirely of invalid signatures, Bureau staff recommended and the Board of State Canvassers (Board) approved several changes to the processes used to review nominating petitions.

By this year's filing deadline of April 23, 2024, Bureau staff received nominating petitions from 120 candidates, including 8 candidates for U.S. Senate, totaling more than 413,000 total signatures submitted. Overall, across all candidates and circulators, a significantly lower volume sheets showing clear indications of fraud and signatures of dubious authenticity were submitted as compared to 2022, and process improvements allowed staff to process and review these petitions more efficiently.

Significant differences from this cycle included:

- A lower overall number of petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud, and signatures of dubious authenticity, were submitted as compared to 2022.
- Unlike 2022, when a many circulators submitted petition sheets consisting entirely of fraudulent signatures, in this cycle petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud were mixed in with seemingly legitimate petition sheets with the same names of circulators listed on the petitions, and some petitions sheets showing clear indications of fraud also had legitimate signatures on them.
- The use of random sampling to review nominating petitions for statewide office (U.S. Senate) allowed for a more time-efficient review of the 210,127 signatures submitted, collectively, by U.S. Senate candidates.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

- The immediate scanning and automated electronic “stamping” of all nominating petitions created three benefits:
  - Less time spent processing Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) requests for nominating petitions by challengers and candidates, as all nominating petitions had already been scanned in and were available for electronic transmission to the FOIA requester.
  - More time to process challenges and responses to challenges.
  - More efficient staff review of petitions, because of easy access to electronic scans of petition sheets.

Because of the lower volume of sheets showing clear indications of fraud, the process improvements described above, and the fact that petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud and signatures of dubious authenticity were mixed in with seemingly legitimate petition sheets and signatures, staff were able to look up individually all signatures of dubious authenticity that were relevant to determining whether a candidate had a sufficient number of valid signatures to qualify for the ballot.

## **II. Petition intake and scanning**

Bureau staff accepted nominating petitions and supplements to nominating petitions up to the filing of deadline of 4 p.m. on April 23. Soon after each petition was received, the petition sheets were scanned, and each sheet was digitally numbered. The original (paper) sheets were retained in labeled envelopes or boxes.

## **III. Petition availability and challenges**

Petitions were made available for FOIA requests following staff scanning of the petition sheets. Staff responded to requests for copies of petition sheets immediately. Challenges to nominating petitions for all candidates except U.S. Senate were due by April 30. MCL 168.552(8). Because it took 2 business days for the Senate candidate samples to be generated and made available, the deadline for challenges to U.S. Senate nominating petitions was extended 2 business days to May 2.

## **IV. Petition face review and identification of sheets showing clear indications of fraud**

For petitions other than U.S. Senate, staff first conducted a face review of every sheet in every nominating petition. During face review, staff identify some issues that render signatures or entire sheets of signatures invalid. Although face review does not involve individual lookups of each signature on the sheet, during face review staff note sheets showing clear indications of fraud, such as each signature appearing to be written in the same handwriting.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

When sheets showing clear indications of fraud were identified, the name of circulator was noted and added to a list of circulator names appearing on sheets showing clear indications of fraud. Staff also noted when a challenge made to any candidate's nominating petitions identified a circulator name appearing on petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud.

If staff agreed with the challenge that the petition sheets showed clear indications of fraud, or if after looking up individually the signatures submitted by circulator, staff determined that some or all signatures were of dubious authenticity, the circulator's name was added to a list of circulator names appearing on sheets showing clear indications of fraud. Finally, when staff learned about suspicious circulator activity in petitions filed with a different filing official, the circulator's name was added to a list of circulator names appearing on sheets with clear indications of fraud.<sup>1</sup>

As in 2022<sup>2</sup>, sheets were determined to show clear indications of fraud if any of the following occurred:

- An unusually large number of petition sheets where every signature line was completed, or where every line was completed but one or two lines were crossed out.
- Sheets that appeared to be "round-tabled," a practice in which a group of individuals passes around sheets with each individual signing one line on each sheet with handwriting

---

<sup>1</sup> Staff received an attempted challenge to Matthew Ackerman from Mark Brewer. The challenge was not processed because it was submitted after the deadline, and accordingly there is not a staff report on the Ackerman petitions. Even if the untimely challenge had been processed, it is extremely unlikely it would have resulted in disqualification of the candidate. Ackerman had 10,256 facially valid signatures after face review. While the untimely challenge purported to challenge 4,574 signatures, and listed a total of 4,911 signatures in the included table, once 555 duplicate-challenges against the same signatory were removed (signatures challenged for multiple reasons and counted multiple times in the untimely challenge), the untimely challenge called 4,356 signatures into question. 499 of those untimely challenges were made to the validity of the *circulator's* signature. Because that is not a listed reason for a challenge under the Board and Bureau's procedures, staff would not have processed that portion of the challenge even if timely, leaving the number of untimely challenged signatures at 3,857. Even assuming all 3,857 of those challenged signatures were invalid, Ackerman would have been left with 6,399 facially valid signatures, or a "cushion" of 199 signatures. Furthermore, based on the results of a similar challenge to signatures in the Neilson petition, staff likely would have found that a significant percentage of the untimely challenged signatures were actually valid. Thus, even if the 499 untimely challenges to circulator signatures were considered (and accordingly, 300 of the untimely challenged signatures would need to be valid for Ackerman to be above the 6,200-signature threshold), it is extremely likely at least 300 signatures would be valid. Therefore, it is extremely unlikely that enough signatures would be invalid to move Ackerman below the 6,200-signature threshold for qualification. Staff did note the circulator names, however, as described below.

<sup>2</sup> For more explanation of these issues, see 2022 report, attached for reference.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

different from the circulator's handwriting, in an attempt to make handwriting and signatures appear authentic and received from actual voters.

- Sheets on which every instance of the handwriting of certain letters across different signatory lines and sheets, including in the signatures themselves, was near-identical.
- Sets of sheets where the two or three distinct handwriting styles appeared on multiple sheets.

Individual review of these sheets showing clear indications of fraud<sup>3</sup> revealed one or more of the following:

- Discrepancies between the signature appearing on the petition sheet and the voter's signature appearing in the Qualified Voter File (QVF).
- An unusually high number of signatures corresponding to addresses where the voter was previously but not currently registered to vote.
- An unusually high number of signatures corresponding to formerly registered voters whose registrations were cancelled because the voter had died months or years prior to the date of the signature.
- Several errors in the voters' names where the name on the petition was spelled differently than the voters' registration in the QVF or where the petition used the voter's middle name or a diminutive or nickname.

---

<sup>3</sup> For more explanation of these issues, see 2022 report.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

The following sheets are some of the most obvious examples of fraud—where the circulator made little effort to vary the signatures of purported signers:

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION (COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)** INEIS011.CJA.UUUB.ZU

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of GENESEE, and State of Michigan, nominate LISA MARIE NEILSON (Name of Candidate) as a candidate for the office of COURT OF APPEALS JUDGE – REGULAR TERM – NON-INCUMBENT POSITION (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) ending 1/1/2031 (Street Address or Rural Route) 2344 WINDEMERE ROAD (City or Township) BIRMINGHAM to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6<sup>TH</sup> day of AUGUST, 20 24 (District, if any) 2ND

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING		
					Month	Day	Year
<i>Willie Hayes</i>	Willie Hayes	5438 Thunderbird pass	Grand Blanc	48839	3	23	24
<i>J Evans</i>	Daniel Evans	1176 Garnsey Ave	Grand Haven	79917	3	23	24
<i>Gary Reed Jr</i>	Gary Reed Jr	4499 Lake michigan Dr	Grand Haven	49417	3	23	24
<i>Adam wells</i>	Adam wells	5466 Ode saybrook Rd	Grand Blanc	48839	3	23	24
<i>Trisha Frost</i>	Trisha Frost	755 McColman rd	Lennon	48883	3	23	24
<i>Minson Carter</i>	Minson Carter	2513 Hollyoakes	Flint	48832	3	23	24
<i>Marsha Richards</i>	Marsha Richards	3952 Brookgate Dr	Flint	48807	3	23	24
<i>Kenneth Jackson</i>	Kenneth Jackson	7132 Heathst	Genesee	48532	3	23	24
<i>Ms. Dodge</i>	MI Jans Dodge	2041 kenneth ST	Burton	48529	3	23	24
<i>L Bradford</i>	Carrie Bradford	22200 willard Rd	Montrose	48457	3	23	24

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**  
The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of the state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR – DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**  
(Signature of Circulator) *Lashon White* (Date) 3 12 24  
(Printed Name of Circulator) Lashon White  
(Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - (Do not enter a post office box) 256 95 Hoffinger  
(City or Township, State, Zip Code) Flint MI 48866  
(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan) Genesee

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION (CITY/TOWNSHIP NONPARTISAN)** Griffin V. District 000144

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of Detroit, and State of Michigan, nominate HERMAN GRIFFIN IV (Name of Candidate) as a candidate for the office of 36th District Court Judge, Non-Incumbent, Regular term (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) ending 36th District (District, if Any) 587 Lodge Drive (Street Address or Rural Route) Detroit (City or Township) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6th day of August, 20 24

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
				MONTH	DAY	YEAR
<i>Willie Holmes</i>	Willie Holmes	1025 Greensboro	48224	4	20	24
<i>Damon Adams</i>	Damon Adams	Smith and Kelly	48205	4	20	24
<i>Valeria Adams</i>	Valeria Adams	5003 East Outer Drive	48231	4	20	24
<i>Adrian Jones</i>	Adrian Jones	6394 Guilford	48224	4	20	24
<i>Barrett Stanley</i>	Barrett Stanley	Guilford	48224	4	20	24
<i>Larry Moore</i>	Larry Moore	5003 East Outer Drive	48231	4	20	24
<i>Tyrah Frazier</i>	Tyrah Frazier	10485 Megul	48227	4	20	24
<i>Amber Adams</i>	Amber Adams	Smith and Kelly	48205	4	20	24
<i>Lutaya Hamilton</i>	Lutaya Hamilton	12733 Wilshire Dr	48213	4	20	24
<i>Angel Jones</i>	Angel Jones	1491 Baldwin St	48214	4	20	24
<i>Ashley Reese</i>	Ashley Reese	Binder St	48234	4	20	24
<i>Aaron Moore</i>	Aaron Moore	14916 Fleming	48231	4	20	24
<i>Dominique Jacobs</i>	Dominique Jacobs	12545 Kelly	48205	4	20	24
<i>Tasha Wakefield</i>	Tasha Wakefield	5251 Falmbrook	48224	4	20	24

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**  
The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township listed in the heading of the petition, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR – DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**  
(Signature of Circulator) *Delen Adams* (Date) 4 20 24  
(Printed Name of Circulator) Delen Adams  
(Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - (Do not enter a post office box) 5003 Outer Drive  
(City or Township, State, Zip Code) Detroit MI 48231  
(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan) Wayne

Michigan Election Resources - Form No. 2023 - 2015 Revision - Approved by State Director of Elections



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

In other cases, while the signatures showed variation and the petition sheet was not obviously fraudulent on its face, no signatures on the petition sheet matched the signature on file, as in the examples below:

Kumar, Congress, 000058

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION** (COUNTYWIDE PARTISAN)

The undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of MACOMB and State of Michigan, nominate Anil Kumar (Name of Candidate) 1556 Bartley Ln (Street Address or Rural Route) as a candidate of the Democratic Party for the office of U.S. House of Representatives (Title of Office) 10th (District, if any) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6th day of August, 2024.

**WARNING-A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MO	DAY	YEAR
<i>Shawn Dhapa</i>	Shawn Dhapa	27337 Prentner	Warren	48088	7	18	24
<i>Rich Lankes</i>	Rich Lankes	44945 21 1/2 W 12	New Baltimore	48041	4	16	24
<i>Priscilla Taylor</i>	Priscilla Taylor	19050 Meadow	Stamford	48067	4	18	24
<i>Carla Hables</i>	Carla Hables	25244 Crofton Ave Lot 16	Roseville	48066	4	18	24
<i>Tiffany Jarney</i>	Tiffany Jarney	29235 Cedarwood	Roseville	48066	4	18	24
<i>San Alexander</i>	San Alexander	31165 Tiger	New Baltimore	72072	7	18	24
<i>John Jarney</i>	John Jarney	2573 Cunningham Ave	Warren	48091	4	18	24
<i>Ann Bugbee</i>	Ann Bugbee	2495 Potomac	Centerline	48015	4	15	24
<i>Patricia Egan</i>	Patricia Egan	21851 Angels	Warren	48092	7	18	24
<i>Julie Jarzema</i>	Julie Jarzema	6154 Bell Ln.	Warren	48092	4	18	24

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR** **CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE**  
**CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided; otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING-A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

Mario Brian (Signature of Circulator) 4 18 24 (Date)  
Mario Brian (Printed Name of Circulator)  
4031 Edmore Dr (Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) (Do not enter a post office box)  
Warren, MI 48092 (City or Township, State, Zip Code)

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

Kumar, Congress, 000036

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION** (COUNTYWIDE PARTISAN)

The undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of MACOMB and State of Michigan, nominate Anil Kumar (Name of Candidate) 1556 Bartley Ln (Street Address or Rural Route) as a candidate of the Democratic Party for the office of U.S. House of Representatives (Title of Office) 10th (District, if any) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6th day of August, 2024.

**WARNING-A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MO	DAY	YEAR
<i>Royal Jacobelli</i>	Royal Jacobelli	53639 Christy	New Baltimore	48051	3	30	24
<i>Kamya Toner</i>	Kamya Toner	10544 Durand	Plymouth	48061	06	30	24
<i>Ashley Winter</i>	Ashley Winter	90 Kite	McClintons	48143	3	30	24
<i>Anthony Greddes</i>	Anthony Greddes	52294 Lindermann	Warren	48093	3	30	24
<i>Pamela Grant</i>	Pamela Grant	22698 Colony St.	Saint Clair Shores	48080	3	30	24
<i>Tamara Al-Jabi</i>	Tamara Al-Jabi	2988 Parkway Dr	Sterling Heights	48314	06	30	24
<i>Nida Reiser</i>	Nida Reiser	2368 Englewood	Centerline	48015	3	30	24
<i>Ernest Willis</i>	Ernest Willis	37127 Camelot	Sterling Hts	48312	3	30	24
<i>Tammy Greene</i>	Tammy Greene	17755 Elk	Sibley Township	48315	3	30	24
<i>Don Brown</i>	Don Brown	2136 Melrose	Eastpointe	48021	3	30	24

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR** **CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE**  
**CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided; otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING-A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

Flora Brown (Signature of Circulator) 3 30 24 (Date)  
Flora Brown (Printed Name of Circulator)  
4031 Edmore Drive (Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) (Do not enter a post office box)  
Warren, MI 48092 (City or Township, State, Zip Code)

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

Often, a single petition sheet would alternate between signatures that sufficiently matched the signature on file and signatures that bore no redeeming qualities. This potentially demonstrates a more sophisticated scheme than that used by circulators in 2022. Instead of submitting petition sheets where all signatures were obviously written in the same hand, it appears that several circulators intentionally alternated valid and invalid signatures randomly in an attempt to avoid detection. Similarly, some circulators submitted wholly valid petition sheets for one drive and sheets showing clear indications of fraud for another.

Griffin IV, District 000169

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE**

**NOMINATING PETITION**  
(CITY/TOWNSHIP NONPARTISAN)

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the City of Detroit, in the County of Wayne, and State of Michigan, nominate **HERMAN GRIFFIN IV** (Name of Candidate) 587 Lodge Drive (Street Address or Rural Route) Detroit (City or Township), as a candidate for the office of 36th District Court Judge, Non-Incumbent, Regular term (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) 36th District (District, if Any) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6th day of August, 2024.

**WARNING-A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	ZIP CODE	MONTH	DAY	YEAR
<i>Andra Parks</i>	Andra Parks sa	8219 Rosmondave	48228	4	16	24
<i>Ashley Goode</i>	Ashley Goode	9021 Fenton	48226	4	16	24
<i>Delmar Lee Jr</i>	Delmar Lee Jr	1622 Fern	48221	4	16	24
<i>Antoinette Siva</i>	Antoinette Siva	3226 Coleridge	48202	4	16	24
<i>Charlene Sutton</i>	Charlene Sutton	9033 Fenton	48208	4	16	24
<i>Drew Jay</i>	Drew Jay	118 N. Quince	48203	4	16	24
<i>Jutarris Veran</i>	Jutarris Veran	1471 Fenton	48205	4	16	24
<i>Nete Pearl</i>	Nete Pearl	8017 Fenton	48205	4	16	24
<i>Kifa Cornwell</i>	Kifa Cornwell	4613 Meldeum	48207	4	16	24
<i>Euf Pearl</i>	Euf Pearl	6788 Wolf	48204	4	16	24
<i>Ann Johnston</i>	Ann Johnston	2506 Zerkow St	48206	4	16	24
<i>Cytheria Stewart</i>	Cytheria Stewart	4983 Marlowe St	48227	4	16	24
<i>BD Dennis</i>	BD Dennis	2418 W. Hancock	48208	4	16	24
<i>D-Wesley Price</i>	D. Wesley Price	8234 Penrod	48205	4	16	24

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township listed in the heading of the petition, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross (X) or check mark (✓) in the box provided; otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING-A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

(Signature of Circulator) *Diana Perez* (Date) 04/21/24

(Printed Name of Circulator) Diana Perez

(Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - (Do not enter a post office box) 14324 Longacre St.

(City or Township, State, Zip Code) Detroit MI 48227

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

MICHIGAN ELECTION REGULATIONS - Form No. 990A - 2015 Revision - Approved by State Director of Elections



STATE OF MICHIGAN
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS
LANSING

Neilson.CO.A.000471

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

NOMINATING PETITION
(COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of OAKLAND and State of Michigan, nominate LISA MARIE NEILSON (Name of Candidate)
2344 WINDEMERE ROAD BIRMINGHAM as a candidate for the office of COURT OF APPEALS JUDGE - REGULAR TERM - NON-INCUMBENT POSITION (Street Address or Rural Route) (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date)
2ND to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6TH day of AUGUST, 2024. 1/1/2031 (District, if any)

WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.

Table with 6 columns: Signature, Printed Name, Street Address or Rural Route, Name of City or Township, Zip Code, DATE OF SIGNING (Month, Day, Year). Contains 10 rows of handwritten signatures and names.

CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE

CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION. (Signature of Circulator) Melissa Austin (Date) 01/31/2024 (Printed Name of Circulator) Melissa Austin (Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box) 18881 Addison Dr (City or Township, State, Zip Code) Southfield MI 48033 (County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan

Longstreet.Cir.C1.000033

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

NOMINATING PETITION
(COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of WAYNE and State of Michigan, nominate CHARLES OLIVER LONGSTREET II (Name of Candidate)
18915 Mairland Detroit as a candidate for the office of 3RD CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE - REGULAR TERM NON-INCUMBENT (Street Address or Rural Route) (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date)
to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 6TH day of AUGUST, 2024. (District, if any)

WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.

Table with 6 columns: Signature, Printed Name, Street Address or Rural Route, Name of City or Township, Zip Code, DATE OF SIGNING (Month, Day, Year). Contains 10 rows of handwritten signatures and names.

CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE

CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION. (Signature of Circulator) Londell Thomas (Date) 4/1/24 (Printed Name of Circulator) Londell Thomas (Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box) 18712 Elkhardt (City or Township, State, Zip Code) Harper Woods MI 48225 (County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

**V. Identification and review of petition sheets with circulator names appearing on sheets with clear indications of fraud**

Once the full list of circulator names appearing on sheets showing clear indications of fraud was compiled, all nominating petitions submitted to the Bureau were reviewed to determine if they included sheets submitted with these identified circulator names. Under this process, some petitions had to be reviewed again in case circulator names that were identified after the initial face review were included in that petition. Sheets with an identified circulator name were scrutinized closely. If the number of signatures appearing on sheets with an identified circulator exceeded the candidate's "cushion" of facially valid signatures above the number of signatures required, staff looked up signatures individually to determine if the candidate had a sufficient number of valid signatures.

Unlike the petitions submitted by circulators in 2022, the petition sheets from identified circulators that were reviewed this cycle did not consist entirely of invalid signatures.<sup>4</sup> Some sheets with these circulator names appeared to be fully valid, and some sheets included a mix of valid signatures and signatures of dubious authenticity. Because of this, and because more time was available to look up each individual signature owing to a lower number of invalid signatures being submitted this cycle as well as process improvements that led to time efficiencies elsewhere, staff looked up all signatures on sheets with the names of identified signatures individually to the extent necessary to determine the sufficiency of nominating petitions.

Under this process, followed when necessary to determine the sufficiency of a nominating petition, every signature on the sheet was looked up individually in QVF to determine if the signer was properly registered in the city or township indicated on the petition and if the signature matched the signature on file. If the signer was not registered in the city or township indicated or the signature did not match the signature on file, the signature was determined to be invalid.

For some candidates, invalid signatures appearing on sheets showing clear indications of fraud were part or all of the reason the candidate's petition contained an insufficient number of valid signatures. If applicable, this is noted in the candidate's staff report. For these candidates, Bureau staff stopped looking up individual signatures after the candidate had already dropped below the number needed for certification to the ballot. In other instances, invalid signatures were identified

---

<sup>4</sup> In 2022, the circulators listed in staff's report submitted sheets consisting entirely of fraud. Staff reviewed thousands of signatures and did not find a single valid signature submitted by any of these circulators. For other circulators suspected of fraud, staff did find some valid signatures mixed in with fraudulent signatures submitted, and removed those petition sheets from the list of sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators (even though they included numerous signatures of dubious authenticity). For more detail, see the 2022 report.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

in the candidate's filing, but the volume was not enough to move the number of valid signatures below the threshold for ballot qualification.

When a challenge alleged fraud and staff had not independently identified circulators named in the challenge, staff reviewed the petition sheets of identified circulators in the course of processing the challenge. When staff had already identified the named circulators and reviewed the petition sheets, it was not necessary to process that portion of the challenge. In either case, sheets submitted by identified circulators were thoroughly reviewed.

#### **VI. Random sampling of U.S. Senate candidates**

U.S. Senate candidate nominating petitions were reviewed using a separate, random sampling process. Under this process, a random sample of 750 signatures was taken for each candidate. All signatures within the sample were individually face reviewed and checked against QVF by staff. Staff also reviewed challenges submitted to the sampled signatures of some candidates' nominating petitions. Under this process, if a signer was not registered in the city or township indicated or the signature did not match the signature on file, staff determined that the signature was invalid. Based on the percentage of valid signatures in the sample and the total number of signatures submitted by the candidate, staff projected a total number of valid signatures in the candidate's "universe" of submitted signatures and recommended the Board determine the petition sufficient or insufficient based on the formula approved by the Board.<sup>5</sup>

Because staff used random sampling for U.S. Senate candidates, it was not necessary to separately review petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud in those petitions. Whatever percentage of invalid signatures exists in each Senate candidate's petition – whether because of sheets showing clear indications of fraud or some other reason – is reflected proportionately in the sample, and, in turn, in the projected number of valid signatures in the universe. Therefore, the separate review of sheets showing clear indications of fraud was irrelevant to the determination of whether Senate candidate petitions were sufficient.<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> For more information, see Random Sampling Results for U.S. Senate Candidate Nominating Petitions.

<sup>6</sup> After the challenge deadline, the Bureau received a letter from the Democratic Senatorial Campaign Committee requesting review and investigation of petitions submitted by some Senate candidates. This was not processed as a challenge as it was past the challenge deadline, and for the reasons above, did not affect Bureau determinations of the validity rates of Senate candidates. However, staff reviewed the letter and will include the relevant information in referrals for further investigation of petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

## VII. Referral for investigation

Following the Board's review of staff recommendations and certification of candidates to the ballots, the Bureau will refer sheets showing clear indications of fraud for further investigation. Currently, the Bureau does not have reason to believe that any specific candidates or campaigns were aware of the activities of circulators whose names appear on sheets showing clear indications of fraud. At this point, the Bureau does not know the specific circumstances that led to these petition sheets being completed and submitted.

## VIII. Future process changes

The Bureau recommends that candidates and campaigns implement a quality control process before filing petitions, and to cross out any invalid signatures proper to submission. The Bureau added detail and emphasis to this recommendation in the petition manual<sup>7</sup> for this cycle, and as noted above the volume of invalid signatures submitted was lower than 2022. The Bureau will consider adding further emphasis to this point, as collectively, candidates' nominating petitions for this cycle still included a significant number of petitions showing clear indications of fraud.

Random sampling also proved to be an efficient and effective process for reviewing statewide candidates. It significantly reduced the number of signatures staff had to review individually, and also reduced the number of signatures challenged, allowing for a faster processing of challenges and responses. This, in turn, freed up more resources to look up individual signatures on other candidate petitions. The Bureau will consider recommending extending random sampling to Judge of Court of Appeals candidates for 2026. These candidates must submit at least 6,200 signatures,<sup>8</sup> and random sampling would likely add efficiency to the review of those petitions. For candidates who must submit fewer signatures (such as U.S. Representative in Congress), random sampling still remains impractical.

Staff will also consider recommending further technological enhancements to the process, including automated petition-form review and automated signature review. These potential enhancements were discussed during Board meetings when considering process improvements for this election cycle and will be explored further in advance of potential recommendations to the Board for the 2025-26 cycle.

---

<sup>7</sup> [Petition Manual: Statewide Initiative, Referendum, Constitutional Amendment Petitions, Partisan Nominating, and Petitions for State and Federal Office.](#)

<sup>8</sup> [Judicial Elective Offices Manual.](#)



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

**IX. List of Circulator Names Appearing on Petition Sheets Showing Clear Indications of Fraud**

The following circulator names appearing on petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud were identified by staff during staff's face review, challenges submitted to a candidate's petitions, or other reporting.<sup>9 10 11</sup>

Delon Adams  
Andre Berry  
Elisha Brown  
Marico/Mariko Brown  
Diallo/Diablo Daniely  
Nancie Gibson  
Laurence Gooden  
Gersena Guyton  
Robert Harris  
Brigette Hawkins  
Robert Hill

Ethan Holtz  
Cortade/Cortaze Howard  
Aaron Jones  
Eric Michaels  
Lolita Moore  
Regina Pierce  
Loren Primm  
Ashley Small  
Debra Stokes  
Londell Thomas  
LaShona White

---

<sup>9</sup> The attempted challenge to Matthew Ackerman included Diallo Daniely, Robert Harris, and the following additional 13 circulator names listed with subject in headings within the challenge: Lorenzo Avery, Carolyn Bell, Lawana Clark, Alvin Crossnoe, Yolanda Ellison, Hurrbm Hicks, Faye Lapp, Kyna Pickens, James Spencer, Robyn Reynolds, Nathan Ryans, Bruce Sawyers, Damascus Taylor. The challenge also included 9 additional circulator names discussed separately: Sultan Basha, Dale Cain, John Damon, Jordan Evans, Donald Harris, Glenda McNeil, Quintiesha Reed, D'Angelo Shelton, Laneer Thompson. With the exception of Harris and Daniely, staff did not identify these circulator names in other petitions in numbers substantial enough to affect qualification for the ballot. Staff spot-checked some signatures from the additional named circulators in the Ackerman petitions, and the spot-checked signatures were valid.

<sup>10</sup> The Frenkel challenge to Lisa Neilson also named Christine DiMichele and Anna Marie O'Brien as circulator names appearing on petition sheets showing clear indications of fraud. Staff found that a significant majority of signatures on those sheets were valid.

<sup>11</sup> On the evening of May 23, Democratic Senatorial Campaign Committee also named Dennis Rodzik, Tim Yarn, Joslyn Kinney, George Houston, James White, Tracee Bradford, Robert Gill (possibly same as Robert Hill), John Damon. This information was received too late for staff to conduct a separate review of all petitions for each of these names, but based on previous review of petitions, staff believes it is extremely unlikely these names appeared in other petitions with numbers substantial enough to affect qualification for the ballot.



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS  
LANSING

May 23, 2022

**STAFF REPORT ON FRAUDULENT NOMINATING PETITIONS**

**I. Introduction**

During review of candidate nominating petitions submitted for the August 2, 2022 Primary Election, Bureau of Elections (Bureau) staff identified 36 petition circulators<sup>1</sup> who submitted fraudulent petition sheets consisting entirely of invalid signatures. All petition sheets submitted by these circulators displayed suspicious patterns indicative of fraud, and staff reviewing these signatures against the Qualified Voter File (QVF) did not identify any signatures that appeared to be submitted by a registered voter. Taken together, these circulators provided nominating petitions in at least 10 petition drives. During standard petition review, staff identified the same circulators in several sets of petitions for which at least 2,000 signatures were required to appear on the ballot, including candidates for governor, circuit judge, and district judge.

In total, the Bureau estimates that these circulators submitted at least 68,000 invalid signatures submitted across 10 sets of nominating petitions. In several instances, the number of invalid signatures submitted by these circulators was the reason a candidate had an insufficient number of valid signatures. In other instances, while invalid signatures were identified in the candidate's filing, the number was insufficient to move the number of signatures below the threshold for ballot qualification.

Although it is typical for staff to encounter some signatures of dubious authenticity scattered within nominating petitions, the Bureau is unaware of another election cycle in which this many circulators submitted such a substantial volume of fraudulent petition sheets consisting of invalid signatures, nor an instance in which it affected as many candidate petitions as at present.

Because of the pervasiveness of fraudulent petition sheets and the fact that sheets submitted by the same circulators affected multiple candidates, staff have prepared an omnibus report documenting the detection of, and staff response to, these petition sheets. The extent to which each candidate's ballot qualification is affected by these circulators is proportional to the number and percentage of these circulator sheets in the candidate's nominating petition submission. This report explains how and when staff identified the fraudulent petition sheets, the process developed to address the fraudulent sheets, and an appendix showing examples of the practices these circulators used to submit invalid signatures.

---

<sup>1</sup> See Appendix II for list of circulators.

## II. Timeline of Detection and Response

The Bureau of Elections accepts filings for candidates seeking election to certain offices in Michigan. Most candidates make their filings in the two weeks preceding the filing deadline. In 2022, the filing deadline was April 19.<sup>2</sup>

Given the large number of candidates seeking to qualify for the ballot, Bureau staff began to review nominating petitions at the end of March, after several gubernatorial candidates had submitted nominating petitions. During this review, staff noticed a large number of petition sheets, submitted by certain circulators, appeared fraudulent and consisted entirely of invalid signatures. These petition sheets tended to display at least one of the following patterns:

- An unusually large number of petition sheets where every signature line was completed, or where every line was completed but one or two lines were crossed out;<sup>3</sup>
- Many sheets showing signs of apparent attempts at “intentional” signature invalidity, including sheets where an entry listed a county in the “city or township” field, or a birth date rather than the date of signing in the “date” field;<sup>4</sup>
- An unusually large number of petition sheets that showed no evidence of normal wear that accompanies circulation, including folding, scuffing, minor water damage from rain, or any of the other characteristics that come from sheets being kept on clipboards and handled by multiple people in public or outdoor conditions.
- Sheets that appeared to be “round-tabled” a practice in which a group of individuals passes around sheets with each individual signing one line on each sheet with handwriting different from the circulator’s handwriting, in an attempt to make handwriting and signatures appear authentic and received from actual voters.
- Sheets on which blank and completed lines were randomly interspersed, indicating that a sheet had been submitted “mid-round-table.” In such cases, a sheet was submitted even though the round-tabling process had not been completed.
- Sheets where all ten lines had signatures and partial addresses or dates, but only a random subset were fully completed;
- Sheets on which every instance of the handwriting of certain letters across different signatory lines and sheets, including in the signatures themselves, was near-identical;<sup>5</sup>
- Sets of sheets where the two or three distinct handwriting styles appeared on multiple sheets.<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> “[N]ominating petitions shall be received by the secretary of state for filing in accordance with this act up to 4 p.m. of the fifteenth Tuesday before the August primary.” (MCL 168.53)

<sup>3</sup> Sheets on which every line is completing are relatively uncommon because of the requirement that voters sign petition sheets only with a header including the voter’s county of residence. Usually, a circulator gathering signatures will collect signatures on multiple sheets for multiple counties simultaneously. When the circulator has completed circulation of those sheets, they will often have a handful of entirely completed sheets and a roughly equivalent number of partially completed sheets. The fraudulent-petition circulators submitted few sheets with fewer than ten signatures, and most of the sheets with fewer than ten signatures were the result of signatures crossed out in black marker rather than any remaining blanks. The cross-out signatures appear to attempts to mimic legitimate circulators crossing off the names of signatories determined to be ineligible prior to submission.

<sup>4</sup> These errors are uncommon but sporadically observed on sheets submitted by typical circulators. In this case they appear to be an unsuccessful attempt to mimic the difficulties of collecting signatures from real individuals.

<sup>5</sup> For example, capital “A” and “H” would be identical across all petition sheets for a given circulator.

<sup>6</sup> For example, in one cluster each sheet would have a distinctive slanted signature, a distinctive looping signature, and a signature that was unusually small.

Based on these observations, staff began to compare signatures on the petitions to the QVF. During its review against the QVF, staff noticed the following:

- Discrepancies in the signature appearing on the petition sheet and the voter’s signature appearing in the Qualified Voter File;
- An unusually high number of signatures corresponding to addresses where the voter was previously but not currently registered to vote;<sup>7</sup>
- An unusually high number of signatures corresponding to formerly registered voters whose registrations were cancelled because the voter had died months or years prior to the date of the signature;<sup>8</sup>
- Several errors in the voters’ names where the name on the petition was spelled differently than the voters’ registration in the QVF or where the petition used the voter’s middle name or a diminutive or nickname;
- The jurisdictions listed almost always utilized the mailing address versus the actual jurisdiction.

After review, staff identified across multiple drives numerous circulators that had submitted fraudulent signatures and assembled a list of the names of circulators who had signed multiple petition sheets consisting of invalid signatures. These patterns suggest to staff that the fraudulent circulators were utilizing an outdated mailing list obtained from some source. As more nominating petitions were submitted, staff continued to identify fraudulent sheets and build the list of circulators consistently submitting such sheets.

After the April 19, 2022 filing deadline passed, staff scanned and provided copies of nominating petitions to anyone who had requested copies. As much as possible, staff provides copies of all requested petitions within 24 hours of receiving the request. Challenges to the sufficiency of nominating petitions were submitted to the Bureau of Elections by Tuesday, April 26.<sup>9</sup> Some challenges included lists of circulators who challengers alleged had submitted fraudulent petition sheets. Many of the circulators on the lists included by challengers were the same circulators staff had identified during the initial review of petitions.<sup>10</sup>

### III. Processing Petition Sheets

The Bureau’s standard approach to processing nominating petitions has two stages. First, staff “face reviews” every petition sheet and signature for facial compliance with the Michigan Election Law, which includes: checking that the signature header and the circulator certificate are properly completed; that each signature is accompanied by an address, name, and date; that

---

<sup>7</sup> Many of these voters had moved years prior to the date they allegedly signed the petition sheet. A large number of out-of-date addresses is often the result of fraudulent-petition circulators finding names on outdated voter registration and mailing lists to add to petition sheets.

<sup>8</sup> Similar to the outdated addresses, a high frequency of names of deceased individuals indicates that fraudulent-petition circulators found names to include on petition sheets on an outdated voter registration or mailing list.

<sup>9</sup> As in every election cycle, in addition to challenges to petition signatures, a number of challenges were made to the sufficiency of a candidate’s *Affidavit of Identity* or *Affidavit of Candidacy*. These affidavit challenges are resolved by the Secretary of State in her role as the filing official for these candidates. Just as the Secretary of State does not determine the sufficiency of a candidate’s nominating petitions, the Board of State Canvassers does not determine the sufficiency of a candidate’s filed affidavit. For that reason, staff does not address challenges to affidavits in staff reports presented to the Board.

<sup>10</sup> Some circulators who challengers claimed to have submitted fraudulent petitions were reviewed by staff and found to be legitimate circulators collecting real signatures. For example, one challenge cited Abram Minton, but staff determined that the signatures on Minton’s petitions sheets did not appear to be forged.

the city or township in which the signer claimed to reside was in the county written on the signature header; and other issues required for a facially valid sheet or signature. During past face reviews, the Bureau has identified scattered instances of signatures of dubious authenticity, and upon review of the signature removed these from the total of valid signatures

At the conclusion of stage one (face review), staff determines how many signatures have been disqualified for facial errors and the calculates the balance of remaining potential valid signatures remaining. If the candidate now has fewer signatures than the total required to qualify, the Bureau will recommend that the Board determine the petitions insufficient. If the candidate has more signatures remaining than the required number to qualify, the Bureau notes the difference (the “cushion”).

In the second stage, Bureau staff then reviews any challenges to the petition’s sufficiency. If the number of challenged signatures is larger than the cushion, staff processes the challenge and determines how many of the challenged signatures were invalid. If the number of challenged signatures is not larger than the cushion, staff does not process the challenge because the cushion could not be overcome by the challenge (even if all challenged signatures were invalid, the candidate would still have enough signatures to qualify).

After reviewing the challenge, if the number of potentially valid signatures remaining on the candidate’s nominating petitions falls below the threshold required to be placed on the ballot, staff recommends that the Board of State Canvassers determine the candidate’s petitions to be insufficient. If, at the time processing was complete, the number of potentially valid signatures remaining on the candidate’s nominating petitions is above the threshold required to be placed on the ballot, staff recommends that the Board of State Canvassers certify the candidate’s name to the ballot.

Because, in the past, the number of signatures of dubious authenticity were typically scattered throughout petitions and relatively small in number, the Bureau has previously not developed a separate review procedure for fraudulent petition sheets. Instead, the Bureau would review sheets and signatures individually if identified during face review or during a challenge. However, because of the unprecedented number of fraudulent petition sheets consistent of invalid signatures identified during the initial review of petition sheets submitted this election cycle, and the fact that the same fraudulent-petition circulators submitted petition sheets for many different candidates, it was not practical to review these sheets individually during the course of ordinary face review and challenge processing.

Instead, staff utilized an additional step within the processing method described above. Prior to face review, staff reviewed each candidate’s petitions for petitions signed by circulators who were suspected of submitting fraudulent sheets.<sup>11</sup> Signatures appearing on these fraudulent sheets were separated from the remaining petition sheets for each candidate. To verify that these fraudulent petition sheets did not include sheets or individual signatures that were actually valid signatures submitted by registered voters, staff conducted a targeted signature check of

---

<sup>11</sup> Additionally, during this review staff flagged the names of additional circulators who submitted forged petition sheets. These additional names were checked and, if they were determined to have submitted a large number of entirely forged signature sheets, their names were added to the list of circulators whose petition sheets were pulled prior to the facial review.

signatures across each circulator's sheets for each candidate to confirm that these circulators' submissions in fact consisted of fraudulent sheets with invalid signatures.<sup>12</sup>

The Bureau determined that all reviewed signatures appearing on sheets signed by the fraudulent-petition circulators were invalid. After petition sheets submitted by the fraudulent-petition circulators were identified, the number of signatures appearing on those sheets was totaled and that total was subtracted from the number of signatures submitted by the candidate. If the candidate had enough potentially valid signatures to remaining to avoid immediate disqualification, the petitions were then put through the face review and challenge process described above. If not, Bureau recommended the Board determine the petitions insufficient.

Staff determined that the fraudulent petition sheets consisted of signatures that were invalid because the petitions consisted of names of voters who were not registered in the appropriate jurisdiction, or names of valid registered voters with forged signatures. Staff were able to identify fraudulent petition sheets using a combination of methods. First, staff noted that the signatures, names, addresses, and dates on many of the fraudulent sheets were obviously signed by one or a small number of individuals which can be seen in the Upon noticing these similarities in handwriting, staff began to check individual signatures and voter information against the Qualified Voter File.

Review showed that a significant percentage of alleged signatories were no longer registered in the jurisdiction because they had moved from the address marked on the petition sheet months or years before. Review also revealed that a number of the alleged signatories' registrations were cancelled because the individual had died prior to the date of signing. None of the reviewed signatures appearing on these petition sheets had redeeming qualities demonstrating a match when compared with the signature on file.

#### **IV. Remedial Action**

The Bureau's review of sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators has resulted in determinations that many candidates have insufficient petitions for this election. Candidate-level determinations are described on the staff report for each candidate. Staff are also working with the Michigan Department of State's Office of Investigative Services to refer incidents of apparent fraud to law enforcement for criminal investigation.

At this point, the Bureau does not have reason to believe that any specific candidates or campaigns were aware of the activities of fraudulent-petition circulators. The Bureau notes the preponderance of media reports about the difficulty in securing circulators and signatures this year, given the abundance of petition campaigns nationwide and the continuing lack of in-person events.<sup>13</sup> Reportedly, the average cost of signature gathering rose from \$5 to \$7 per signature to \$20 per signature. A news article from late 2021 indicates that head of the firm was recruiting circulators in Florida.<sup>14</sup> He previously pled guilty to two counts of election fraud in 2011,<sup>15</sup> in

---

<sup>12</sup> If this targeted review showed that a circulator had collected legitimate signatures, the circulator was removed from the list of fraudulent-petition circulators and signatures appearing on that circulator's petition sheets were added back into the universe of potentially valid signatures.

<sup>13</sup> [Soaring signature costs may bar some candidates from making Michigan ballot | Bridge Michigan](#)

<sup>14</sup> [Man who broke law gathering voter signatures in VA now doing same work in Florida | WFLA](#)

<sup>15</sup> Case #: CR11000315-00 and CR11000316-00

which he reportedly instructed two individuals to sign as a witness on dozens of petition sheets filled with signatures they did not collect.<sup>16</sup>

The Bureau does recommend that candidates and campaigns implement a quality control process before filing petitions, and to cross out any invalid signatures proper to submission.<sup>17</sup> Regardless of the level of review candidates conducted before submitting nominating petitions, the Bureau's recommendation to the Board is based on the number of valid signatures remaining after review.

---

<sup>16</sup> [Head of Signature Collection Firm Pleads Guilty | ARLnow - Arlington, Va. local news](#)

<sup>17</sup> See Circulating and Canvassing Countywide Petition Forms (Nominating and Qualifying Petitions), p. 14, available at <https://www.michigan.gov/sos/elections/candidates/filing>

## Appendix I: Examples of Fraudulent Practices

# 1. Identical sheets collected for multiple drives

During the canvass, the Bureau was notified via email by a citizen who indicated that two judicial candidates running for the same office engaged the same group of fraudulent circulators staff identified. The email alleged that the pages circulated are nearly identical which caused Shelton to not submit the signatures. When comparing the pages between the two candidates below, they are virtually identical with the only differences between the two being the name of the information in the heading:

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE**

## NOMINATING PETITION (COUNTYWIDE NON-PARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Non-Partisan Petition form may be used by any non-partisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of **OAKLAND** and State of Michigan, nominate **TRICIA DARE** **170 GREAT PINES DR.** as a candidate for the office of **CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE / REGULAR TERM - NON-INCUMBENT POSITION** **6TH** (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) (Street Address or Rural Route) (District, if any)

to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the **2ND** day of **AUGUST**, 20**22**.

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING MO DAY YEAR
<i>Jenna Henderson</i>	Jenna Henderson	4568 Pearl Rd	Sweet's Creek	48473	03 28 22
<i>T. Smith</i>	T. Smith	107 Wampole	Clarkston	48346	03 28 22
<i>Cynthia Brownell</i>	CYNTHIA BROWNELL	5184 Summit Lake Rd	Oxford	48371	3 28 22
<i>Shirley Deane</i>	Shirley M. Deane	836 Williambury Ct	Waterford	48328	3 29 22
<i>Rebecca E. Hancock</i>	Rebecca E. Hancock	367 Shattwell Ct.	White Lake	48326	3 29 22
<i>Jade Mills</i>	Jade Mills	180 Summit View Ct	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Allison Shuster</i>	Allison Shuster	180 Summit View Ct	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Judith A. Charbonneau</i>	JUDITH A. CHARBONNEAU	968 SPANDE	Farmington	48340	3 29 22
<i>Sheila M. Tomes</i>	Sheila M. Tomes	4900 Earthquest	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Pamela Lea Ray</i>	Pamela Lea Ray	840 S. Cass Lake	Waterford, MI	48328	3 29 22

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

(Signature of Circulator) *[Signature]* (Date) *3 29 2022*

(Printed Name of Circulator) *TRICIA DARE*

(Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box) *170 GREAT PINES DR*

(City or Township, State, Zip Code) *OXFORD MI 48371*

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE**

## NOMINATING PETITION (COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of **Oakland** and State of Michigan, nominate **Amanda J. Shelton** **20285 Coryell Drive** as a candidate for the office of **Judge of Circuit Court - Regular Term - Non-Incumbent Position** **6th Circuit Court** (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) (Street Address or Rural Route) (District, if any)

to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the **2nd** day of **August**, 20**22**.

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING Month Day Year
<i>Jenna Henderson</i>	Jenna Henderson	4568 Pearl Rd	Sweet's Creek	48473	03 28 22
<i>T. Smith</i>	T. Smith	107 Wampole	Clarkston	48346	03 28 22
<i>Cynthia Brownell</i>	CYNTHIA BROWNELL	5184 Summit Lake Rd	Oxford	48371	3 28 22
<i>Shirley Deane</i>	Shirley M. Deane	836 Williambury Ct	Waterford	48328	3 29 22
<i>Rebecca E. Hancock</i>	Rebecca E. Hancock	367 Shattwell Ct.	White Lake	48326	3 29 22
<i>Jade Mills</i>	Jade Mills	180 Summit View Ct	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Allison Shuster</i>	Allison Shuster	180 Summit View Ct	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Judith A. Charbonneau</i>	JUDITH A. CHARBONNEAU	968 SPANDE	Farmington	48340	3 29 22
<i>Sheila M. Tomes</i>	Sheila M. Tomes	4900 Earthquest	White Lake	48386	3 29 22
<i>Pamela Lea Ray</i>	Pamela Lea Ray	840 S. Cass Lake	Waterford, MI	48328	3 29 22

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR**

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

(Signature of Circulator) *[Signature]* (Date) *3 29 2022*

(Printed Name of Circulator) *TRICIA DARE*

(Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) - (Do not enter a post office box) *170 GREAT PINES DR*

(City or Township, State, Zip Code) *OXFORD MI 48371*

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

(Continued: virtually identical petition sheets submitted by the same circulator in the same order for two different candidates in the same race.)

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION** (COUNTYWIDE NON-PARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Non-Partisan Petition form may be used by any non-partisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of **OAKLAND**, and State of Michigan, nominate **TRICIA DARE** **170 GREAT PINES DR.** as a candidate for the office of **CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE / REGULAR TERM - NON-INCUMBENT POSITION** **6TH** (City or Township) (Street Address or Rural Route) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) (District, if any)

**OXFORD** as a candidate for the office of **CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE / REGULAR TERM - NON-INCUMBENT POSITION** **6TH** (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date) (District, if any)

to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the **2ND** day of **AUGUST**, 20**22**, at **408** (District, if any)

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MO	DAY	YEAR
<i>[Signature]</i>	GARY M QUINN	862 Sharon Dr	White Lake	48386	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	GARY PLUMMER	611 Osgood St	FONTIAC	48341	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Liza Aird	1460 Oregon Blvd	Waterford	48327	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Bret Holman	192 Pearson Manor	Waterford	48327	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Shelby Wade	1160 Barkley	Waterford	48329	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	ZOFIA JURKIEWICZ	5026 Majestic Oaks	Commerce Twp.	48382	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	TELLI STAGE	156 ERICK BLVD	White Lake	48386	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	David W. Smith	4336 V. I. Lane	White Lake	48383	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Donna Smith	1459 Walnut Rd	Waterford	48329	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	WILLIAM MASTRONARTEO	3550 Oude Farm Ln	ONTONVILLE	48462	3	28	2022

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR** The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

*[Signature]* **3, 28, 2022** (Date)  
**WILLIAM MASTRONARTEO** (Printed Name of Circulator)  
**3550 Oude Farm Ln** (Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - (Do not enter a post office box)  
**ONTONVILLE, MI 48462** (City or Township, State, Zip Code)  
 (County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

**INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE** **NOMINATING PETITION** (COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of **Oakland**, and State of Michigan, nominate **Amanda J. Shelton** (Name of Candidate)

**20285 Corvett Drive** **Beverly Hills** as a candidate for the office of **Judge of Circuit Court - Regular Term - Non-Incumbent Position** (Street Address or Rural Route) (City or Township) (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date)

**6th Circuit Court** (District, if any)

to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the **2nd** day of **August**, 20**22**.

**WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.**

Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING		
					Month	Day	Year
<i>[Signature]</i>	GARY M QUINN	862 Sharon Dr	White Lake	48386	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	GARY PLUMMER	611 Osgood St	FONTIAC	48341	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Liza Aird	1460 Oregon Blvd	Waterford	48327	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Bret Holman	192 Pearson Manor	Waterford	48327	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Shelby Wade	1160 Barkley	Waterford	48329	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	ZOFIA JURKIEWICZ	5026 Majestic Oaks	Commerce Twp.	48382	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	TELLI STAGE	156 ERICK BLVD	White Lake	48386	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	David W. Smith	4336 V. I. Lane	White Lake	48383	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	Donna Smith	1459 Walnut Rd	Waterford	48329	3	28	22
<i>[Signature]</i>	WILLIAM MASTRONARTEO	3550 Oude Farm Ln	ONTONVILLE	48462	3	28	2022

**CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR** The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [✓] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on the petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

**WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.**

**CIRCULATOR - DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.**

*[Signature]* **3, 28, 2022** (Date)  
**WILLIAM MASTRONARTEO** (Printed Name of Circulator)  
**3550 Oude Farm Ln** (Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - (Do not enter a post office box)  
**ONTONVILLE, MI 48462** (City or Township, State, Zip Code)  
 (County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

**2. Signatures from voters who have been canceled or have not lived at the address on the petition for years.**

Through its review, staff identified a number of fraudulent signatures that were purported to be from voters who had been canceled. Voters were canceled for a variety of reasons which

included moving out of state and death. Several signatures also listed an address where the voter has not resided from at least one to eight years prior to signing.

Brown petition sheet 1435, line 6: moved from address listed in 2014.

6	Rhonda Carson	Bonnie Carson	5446 Lanier Ave	River Rouge	48218	1	28	22
---	---------------	---------------	-----------------	-------------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1291, line 10: died in 2019.

10	Karen Conroy	Karen Conroy	23231 Heritage Dr. apt 401	Woodhaven	48183	1	27	22
----	--------------	--------------	----------------------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1515, line 6: died in 2019.

6	Donald M. Mont	Donald M. Mont	22176 Hall Rd	Woodhaven	48183	1	28	22
---	----------------	----------------	---------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1515, line 9: died in 2021.

9	Thomas Trail	Thomas Trail	14813 Mercedes	Redford	48239	1	28	22
---	--------------	--------------	----------------	---------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1521, line 9: moved from this address in 2014.

9	Linda A. King	Linda A. King	659 N Martin st	Dearborn	48128	1	27	22
---	---------------	---------------	-----------------	----------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1506, line 5: died in 2020.

5	Pammy Claren	Pammy Claren	10 E Castle Street	River Rouge	48128	01	28	22
---	--------------	--------------	--------------------	-------------	-------	----	----	----

Markey petition sheet 1274, line 5: died 1/2022.

5	Joseph Frankowiak	Joseph Frankowiak	326 W Penna av	Warren Hills	48326	3	2	22
---	-------------------	-------------------	----------------	--------------	-------	---	---	----

Johnson petition sheet 602, line 6: moved from this address in 2021.

6	Jacob Lynch	Jacob Lynch	504 Academics Rd	Oakton	48042	3	01	22
---	-------------	-------------	------------------	--------	-------	---	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 2068, line 2: canceled.

2	Peter Saitta	Peter Saitta	909 E 3rd st	Royal Oak	48067	03	1	22
---	--------------	--------------	--------------	-----------	-------	----	---	----

Malone petition sheet 207, line 8: canceled 2021.

8	Antony Lewis	Antony Lewis	18 Church Apt D	Highland Park	48203	4	9	22
---	--------------	--------------	-----------------	---------------	-------	---	---	----

Malone petition sheet 9, line 8: died in 2020.

8	Jason Mande	Jason Mande	4269 Poppen	Edmore	48229	4	14	22
---	-------------	-------------	-------------	--------	-------	---	----	----

Malone petition sheet 418, lines 3 and 9: canceled.

3	Jake Boyd	Jake Boyd	2430 3rd st	Detroit	48201	4	10	22
9	Melany Kelm	Melany Kelm	53 Avalon st	Highland Park	48203	4	10	22

Malone petition sheet 659, line 1 and 2: died in 2021 and 2016, respectively:

1	Thereser Hall	Thereser Hall	42600 Cherry Hill rd	Canton	48187	04	09	22
2	Jay Hearn	Jay Hearn	2104 Norfolk st	Inkster	48141	4	9	22

Malone petition sheet 481, line 2: died in 2018.

2	Samuel Cresswell	Samuel Cresswell	133 Waterbury st	Westland	48186	4	18	22
---	------------------	------------------	------------------	----------	-------	---	----	----

Brandenburg petition sheet 233, line 4: died in 2016.

4	Ruth Mau	Ruth Mau	14155 Shadyview Dr # E63	Plymouth	48170	1	24	22
---	----------	----------	--------------------------	----------	-------	---	----	----

### 3. Signatures where the voter's name was misspelled or utilized an uncommon abbreviation

In some cases, the voter's name is misspelled, either in the signature block or in the block for the voter's printed name. The purported name of a registered voter being misspelled is an indicator of fraud. Although signatures do not need to be legible to be accepted, a large number of petition sheets across multiple drives contained errors in which the proffered signature appears to have a different spelling than the printed name - an indicator of fraud.

Johnson petition sheet 736, line 8: voter's name is Lia and the signature indicates "Lian" or "Liar."

8	Lian Ham	Lia Ham	1809 phillips ave	berkeley	94702	3	5	22
---	----------	---------	-------------------	----------	-------	---	---	----

Johnson petition sheet 736, line 10: voter's surname is Ziga and the signature and printed name indicate "Zigh."

10	Kennedy Zigh	Kennedy Zigh	2808 dover dr	WILSON	98393	63	8B	22
----	--------------	--------------	---------------	--------	-------	----	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 723, line 5: voter's name is Jody and signature and printed name indicate "Joby."

5	Joby Rudy	Jodi Rudy	2200 Berkeley	Oakland	98072	3	8	22
---	-----------	-----------	---------------	---------	-------	---	---	----

Johnson petition sheet 611, line 1: voter's surname is McDonough and printed name indicates "McDough."

1	McDough	Joseph McDonough	2355 humphreys	Berkeley	98044	3	EL	2022
---	---------	------------------	----------------	----------	-------	---	----	------

Johnson petition sheet 603, line 4: voter's surname is Breecher and printed name indicates "Beecher."

4	Adam Beecher	Adam Beecher	5072 Whispriesta	Oakland	98042	03	03	2022
---	--------------	--------------	------------------	---------	-------	----	----	------

Johnson petition sheet 4043, line 1: voter's name is Seana and signature and printed name indicate "Sean."

1	Sean Strye	Sean Strye	17608 Sherwood st	Sunnyvale	98520	4	14	22
---	------------	------------	-------------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 4043, line 3: voter's name is Bornstein and signature and printed name indicate "Bornstien."

3	Mark Bornstien	Mark Bornstien	25787 Dundee rd	Hasterton Woods	98070	4	16	22
---	----------------	----------------	-----------------	-----------------	-------	---	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 2626, line 3: voter's name is Vicki but sheet indicates that she signs her name as "Vicki" but prints it as "Viki."

3	Vicki Pyle	Viki Pyle	9000 Eatherton	Berkeley	98157	4	16	22
---	------------	-----------	----------------	----------	-------	---	----	----

Malone petition sheet 206, line 8: voter's name is Adolfo Gutierrez-Cosme but printed name indicates "Adolf Cosme."

8	Adolf Cosme	Adolf Cosme	823 Frank	Waco Park	48140	4	09	22
---	-------------	-------------	-----------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Malone petition sheet 243, line 1: voter's name is Teddy Tue but signature indicates "Telly T."

1	Telly T	Teddy Tue	1623 mæller st	Garden City	48135	4	10	22
---	---------	-----------	----------------	-------------	-------	---	----	----

Malone petition sheet 497, line 4: voter's name is Brian Lee but signature and printed name indicate "Bryan Lee."

4	Bryan Lee	BRIAN Bryan Lee	12134 Helen St	Southgate	48195	4	11	22
---	-----------	--------------------	----------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Malone petition sheet 208, line 8: voter's name is Shannon Lemmon but printed name indicates "Shannon Lemmons."

8	Shannon Lemmon	Shannon Lemmons	32461 Richard St	Wayne	48184	4	11	22
---	----------------	-----------------	------------------	-------	-------	---	----	----

An additional anomaly is the use of a first name and last initial as a signature. Using a first initial and last name (for example, J. Smith) is not uncommon; the inverse (John S.) is rare. Nonetheless, this unusual combination was included throughout the fraudulent petition sheets, including the below examples:

Brown petition sheet 31, line 3:

3	Stacey V.	Stacey Vargo	423 Sycamore St	Wyandotte	48192	1	29	22
---	-----------	--------------	-----------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 1796, lines 6 and 8:

6	Amanda C.	Amanda Crowley	736 Spruce St	Wyandotte	48197	1	30	22
8	Veronica S	Veronica Shannon	1121 19th St	Wyandotte	48192	1	30	22

Brown petition sheet 2197, line 10:

10	Donald B	Donald Bartos	221 North Dr	Wyandotte	48192	1	31	22
----	----------	---------------	--------------	-----------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 2295, line 2:

2	Arestasia P.	Arestasia Perry	7219 Coleridge dr	Ypsilanti	48197	02	25	22
---	--------------	-----------------	-------------------	-----------	-------	----	----	----

Brown petition sheet 652, line 3:

3	Odell S	ODELL SMITH	16711 Elene St	DETRUIT	48221	7	23	22
---	---------	-------------	----------------	---------	-------	---	----	----

Markey petition sheet 1274, lines 5 and 6:

5	Joseph F	Joseph Frankowiak	326 Alpcuna av	Warren Hills	48326	3	2	22
6	Angela M	Angela Merriweather	29102 Farmbrook Villa Ct	Southfield	48034	3	2	22

Johnson petition sheet 602, line 6:

6	Jacob L	Jacob Lynch	504 Academe Rd	Warren Hills	48326	3	09	22
---	---------	-------------	----------------	--------------	-------	---	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 731, line 8:

8	Vickay JR	Vickay JR	2917 Webster Dr	Oakland	48072	3	5	22
---	-----------	-----------	-----------------	---------	-------	---	---	----

Johnson petition sheet 4043, line 7:

7	Evan D	Evan Donahue	1256 Dulong ave	Madison Heights	48091	9	16	21
---	--------	--------------	-----------------	-----------------	-------	---	----	----

#### 4. Misspellings in other fields or mischaracterizations of jurisdictions

In some cases, the name of the voter's jurisdiction or street was spelled wrong, or the jurisdiction was mischaracterized. For example, Bloomfield Hills was often written as Bloomfield.

Johnson petition sheet 735, line 8: voter lives on Crossbridge Dr. in Holly and the petition sheet indicates "Crosshires Dr." in "Holy."

8.	<i>Heath</i>	Heath Gallares	6395 Cassin Dr	Clarkston	48021	09	22
----	--------------	----------------	----------------	-----------	-------	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 731, lines 4 and 7: the city of Clarkston is spelled “Clarksten.” Additionally, both appear to be written by the same hand.

<i>Clarksten</i>	<i>Clarksten</i>
------------------	------------------

Johnson petition sheet 4064, line 8: voter lives on Callender St, not “Calender St.”

8.	Joseph Attard	Joseph Attard	1801 Calender St	Southfield	48064	09	22
----	---------------	---------------	------------------	------------	-------	----	----

Johnson petition sheet 611, lines 4 and 8: voters live in Bloomfield Hills and petition sheet indicates Bloomfield.

4.	Basil Salah	Basil Salah	1418 Sedan Lake	Bloomfield	48302	09	22
8.	Betty Boud	Betty Boud	2080 Telegraph	Bloomfield	48302	09	22

In addition to the examples above, throughout the Malone submission, fraudulent-petition circulator Stephen Tinnin listed their jurisdiction as Brownstone Township instead of Brownstown Township, as in Malone petition sheets 518, 160, and 342, below.

Name of City or Township	Name of City or Township	Name of City or Township
<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>Brownstone Township</i>
<i>Harper Woods</i>	<i>Harper Woods</i>	<i>Garden City</i>
<i>Ecorse</i>	<i>Detroit</i>	<i>Frenon</i>
<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>detroit</i>
<i>Harper Woods</i>	<i>Harper Woods</i>	<i>westland</i>
<i>WESTLAND</i>	<i>Belleville</i>	<i>Dearborn</i>
<i>westland</i>	<i>detroit</i>	<i>Greenon</i>
<i>Harper Woods</i>	<i>harper woods</i>	<i>Woodhaven</i>
<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>Brownstone</i>	<i>Detroit</i>
		<i>Detroit</i>

### 5. Distinctive flourishes repeated throughout several signatures

Characteristics of certain fraudulent-petition circulators included a distinctive writing slant, use of certain letters or, in this case the lower-case “f” in Flint and circle instead of a dot over the lower-case “i.”

Markey petition sheet 2268, line 6:

6.	<i>Adams</i>	Simone Adams	321 E Philadelphia Blvd	Flint	48505	2	15	22
----	--------------	--------------	-------------------------	-------	-------	---	----	----

Markey petition sheet 2269, line 4:

4.	<i>Davis</i>	April Davis	2801 Norbert St	flint	48504	2	14	22
----	--------------	-------------	-----------------	-------	-------	---	----	----

Markey petition sheet 2363, line 2:

2.	<i>S</i>	Jacob Switalski	6007 N Vassar Rd	flint	48506	12	14	22
----	----------	-----------------	------------------	-------	-------	----	----	----

Markey petition sheet 2251, line 9:

9.	<i>Davies</i>	Dayna Acker	1226 Vincent Ct #28	flint	48503	2	15	22
----	---------------	-------------	---------------------	-------	-------	---	----	----

Brown petition sheet 351, line 9:

9.	Molly W.	MOLLY WILLIS	3355 23rd St	Wyandotte	48192	2	2	22
----	----------	--------------	--------------	-----------	-------	---	---	----

Brandenburg petition sheet 875, line 5:

5.	Patricia Drowe	Patricia Drowe	1728 Henry St	Mechanicville	48122	04	11	22
----	----------------	----------------	---------------	---------------	-------	----	----	----

The 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> signatures on Brown petition sheet 1187 and the 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> signatures on Brown petition sheet 1356 display the same distinctive flourish across the entire signature. The flourish does not appear in any of the four signatures in QVF.

1.	M. Keith Stotts	M. Keith Stotts	3187 Florence St	Garden City	48135	1	20	22
2.	Ralph D Magee	Ralph D Magee	7119 Rosedale Blvd	Allen Park	48101	1	20	22

4.	Landsay Ottaway	Landsay Ottaway	2821 19th Ave	Port Huron	48060	1	19	22
5.	Pamala Hutchinson	Pamala Hutchinson	13108 T. Kobet Rd	Riley	48041	1	19	22

The “M” in the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> signatures on Malone petition sheet 714 is also distinctive.

2.	M. Sullivan	M. Sullivan						
10.	M. Sullivan	M. Sullivan						

In some cases, rather than attempting varying signatures, the circulator would intentionally scrawl illegibly for some or all signatures, as on Craig petition sheet 248, below. Staff compared all of the following signatures against those in the QVF and none had any redeeming qualities. Additionally, the first signer lives in Farmington Hills, not Farmington.

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Paul Wozniak	3078 Aston Ct	Farmington	48331	3	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	David James	2025 North rd	Dearborn	48113	2	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Jesse Craig	1909 Catin Dr	Rochester	48306	3	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Samuel Ryan	6454 Nadine Ln	West Bloomfield	48322	03	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	James Ballard	418 Bold Ave	Rochester	48306	2	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Christopher Chase	5609 Corunna	Clarkston	48302	3	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Josephine Hill	6976 Lexington Dr	West Bloomfield	48322	03	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Steven Matril	4701 Bonnet	West Bloom	48322	03	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Lisa Kaplan	28215 New Castle	West Farmington	48322	2	21	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Abra Franklin	71644 Arvo St	Novi	48313	3	21	22

Craig petition sheet 2548, below, likewise shows consistent use of an intentionally illegible scrawl. None remotely resembled the signer’s QVF signature.

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Charlene Parker	5015 Harding	Detroit	48213	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Colad Foster	1288 Fucifer	Dearborn	48101	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Tyger White	5089 Harding St	Detroit	48213	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Charly Reggs	2977 Arvo St	Farmington	48331	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Ebene Rickel	5092 Harding	Detroit	48213	03	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Perry Wilson	3542 Coveff	Dearborn	48101	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Isabel Robinson	5713 Harding	Detroit	48213	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Ismael Ismael	2272 Fober	Farmington	48331	3	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	Erica Hill	5159 Harding St	Detroit	48213	03	10	22
<i>[Illegible]</i>	David Webb	1962 Hanna	Dearborn	48101	3	10	22

### 6. Petition sheets all in the same hand

Some pages are more obvious than others. For instance, at times fraudulent-petition circulators made little effort to vary handwriting.

Craig petition sheet 887:

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
1. Carl Schick	Earl Schick	32352 Bywood	Fraser	48066	4	7	22
2. Tacuan Tisdale	Tacuan Tisdale	16475 E 3 Mile	East Pointe	48021	4	7	2022
3. Glenda Palk	Glenda Palk	21760 Fairlane	East Pointe	48021	04	07	22
4. Rose Carue	Rose Carue	21753 Clushing ave	East Pointe	48021	4	7	22
5. Nancy Enami	Nancy Enami	5743 Elmer St	Warren	48092	4	7	22
6. David Vasser	David Vasser	31677 Cindy or	Fraser	48066	4	7	22
7. Mary Matthews	Mary Matthews	15561 Gromer	East Pointe	48021	4	7	22
8. Matthew Bangs	Matthew Bangs	22075 Adams	New Haven	48048	4	7	22
9. Cindy Pippin	Cindy Pippin	27330 Gabriel	Warren	48092	4	7	22
10. Herbert Hurcy	Herbert Hurcy	14236 Erin St	Fraser	48066	4	7	22

Craig petition sheet 2066:

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
1. Gary Knoff	Gary Knoff Jr	4304 Roosevelt	Detroit	48208	3	24	22
2. Darrel Krause	Darrel Krause	45661 18th motor	Conan	48112	03	25	2022
3. SHARLEY MILES	SHARLEY MILES	2638 NEBRASKA	DETROIT	48208	3	24	22
4. HELEN HARVEY JR	HELEN HARVEY JR	23609 Detroit	Wayne	48061	3	25	22
5. ORY BROWN	ORY BROWN	3711 Vinchard St	Detroit	48208	3	24	22
6. Marsha Kenney	Marsha Kenney	746 Beacon	Conan	48187	03	25	2022
7. Silvia Appel	Silvia Appel	18100 Blue-55	Detroit	48219	3	25	22
8. Terrell Blizier	Terrell Blizier	3852 Michauk St	Detroit	48208	3	24	22
9. Terry Buzank	Terry Buzank	217 Drithway	Conan	48187	03	25	2022
10. B F Jones	B F Jones	17543 granite	Detroit	48219	3	25	22

Malone petition sheet 243:

Signature	Printed Name	Street Address or Rural Route	Name of City or Township	Zip Code	DATE OF SIGNING		
					Month	Day	Year
1. Teddy Tue	Teddy Tue	1623 Moller St	Garden City	48135	4	10	22
2. Ronald Buzzy	Ronald Buzzy	1544 Rose Ln	Trenon	48183	4	19	22
3. Lisa Barrett	Lisa Barrett	14417 Maddelein St	Detroit	48205	4	14	22
4. Lawrence Paole	Lawrence Paole	8060 Huse St	Detroit	48224	4	17	22
5. Joanna Wood	Joanna Wood	459 Sibley rd	Trenon	48183	4	14	22
6. Musad Saleh	Musad Saleh	2652 Akron St	Dearborn	48120	4	14	22
7. Shan Miller	Shan Miller	414 Stacum St	Trenon	48183	4	14	22
8. Destiny Bobbitt	Destiny Bobbitt	13600 Rosini Dr	Detroit	48265	4	14	22
9. Edward Kish	Edward Kish	20040 Stellen Dr	Brownstown	48183	4	14	22
10. Crystal Smith	Crystal Smith	365 Ethan Dr	Westland	48185	4	14	22

7. Roundtabled sheets

In other instances, they circulated petition sheets among themselves, each filling out a line. The petition sheets below are examples sheet that were submitted "mid-round-table." While most of the values are completed, the people who were charged with forging the signatures on lines 3, 5, and 9 of Craig petition sheet 2521 left those spaces blank. There are distinctive patterns between the completed lines as well.

SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
1. Fatima Kifi	Fatima Kifi	2938 Dan St	Hamtramck	48212	3	11	22
2. Epps Nunts	Epps Nunts	2604 Cadillac	Detroit	48214	3	18	22
3. Timothy Boettger	Timothy Boettger	206 Bay Side	Detroit	48224	3	11	22
4. Dominique Alexander	Dominique Alexander	2000 Bay Side St	Hamtramck	48212	3	11	2022
5. Nicinawu Lindini	Nicinawu Lindini	304 Bay Side	Detroit	48217	3	11	22
6. Gilbert Hall	Gilbert Hall	8850 Nancy	Hamtramck	48212	3	11	22
7. David Kiser	David Kiser	2637 Cadillac Blvd	Detroit	48214	03	11	22
8. Linda Daniels	Linda Daniels	1537 Reynolds	Hamtramck	48212	3	11	2022
9. Dorek Lindini	Dorek Lindini	304 Bay Side	Detroit	48217	3	11	22
10. Sultan Fadel	Sultan Fadel	241 Goodson	Hamtramck	48212	3	11	2022

Below is another example of a sheet that was submitted mid-round-table, where blank and completed lines were randomly interspersed.

Craig petition sheet 812:

	SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	NAME OF CITY OR TOWNSHIP	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
						MONTH	DAY	YEAR
1.	<i>Shan Gorgis</i>	Shan Gorgis	3567 Barbara Dr	Sterling Heights	48303	3	21	22
2.	<i>Dylan King</i>	Dylan King	77644 Alpin	<del>Mont</del>	<del>48325</del>	3	21	22
3.								
4.	<i>Daniel Chabet</i>	Daniel Chabet	40350 Dequandre	Sterling Heights	48310	3	21	22
5.								
6.								
7.	<i>Christina Pender</i>	Christina Pender	37025 Almond Dr	Sterling Heights		5	21	22
8.	<i>Vaha Bekon</i>	Vaha Bekon	47388 Sutter	<del>Mont</del>	<del>48324</del>	3	21	22
9.	<i>Natalia Shamoon</i>	Natalia Shamoon	38649 Archangelo Dr	Sterling Heights	48310	8	21	22
10.								

### 8. Examples from other circulators

Staff's tally for fraudulent-petition circulators and fraudulent signatures likely understates the total volume. Additional examples of sheets clearly completed by a single hand, or which were round-tabled, are below. In the second and third example, alternating lines were filled out by different colored pens to convey randomness. However, similar handwriting is clear across sheets and especially when the lines completed in a certain color are considered together.

Cox (unnumbered because fraudulent-petition circulators were not enough to place candidate below minimum signature threshold)

INDICATE CITY OR TOWNSHIP IN WHICH REGISTERED TO VOTE	SIGNATURE	PRINTED NAME	STREET ADDRESS OR RURAL ROUTE	ZIP CODE	DATE OF SIGNING		
					MONTH	DAY	YEAR
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	AHMAD ALI	15579 duwayne	48180	03	23	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	NABILAH MUSEAD	5443 wood	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	bilal nasser	6811 Borrie	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Abid showahant	3007 thurgood	48212			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	ismahan nasser	6315 barrie	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Normin obied	5733 lewelly	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Fouquier nehme	5956 Sleathway	48226			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Riham ABDU	3979 Belmont	48122			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	ISRAA BUDIDIH	6101 Rendell	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Ashraf nasser	15625 duwayne	48180			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Jabbers idriss	3856 Dearborn	48222			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Daina ammar	6149 Borrie	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Amr nasser	6130 cable main	48126			
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn	<i>Ali</i>	Suelei wife	15437 duwayne	48180			

CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Mark McCartney</i>	Mark McCartney	22895 Bioside Ct	98125	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Ali Ayash</i>	Ali Ayash	5950 Norch Daly	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Shadia Chouair</i>	Shadia Chouair	23405 Longview St	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Nader HabHab</i>	Nader HabHab	370 NOKBORNE	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>KIKK SHECKLER</i>	KIKK SHECKLER	25534 DARTMOUTH	48125	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Islam Ibrahim</i>	Islam Ibrahim	23248 MILITARY	78127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Heather Loomis</i>	Heather Loomis	17297 W Outer Dr	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Rania Jergess</i>	Rania Jergess	6425 highview	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Miada Saad</i>	Miada Saad	19797 Parkway	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Nadim Bisha</i>	Nadim Bisha	0868 Parkway	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Joan Oalloran</i>	Joan Oalloran	17350 W Outer Drive	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Mona Hussain</i>	Mona Hussain	21710 Beechrest	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>CHADE JUMAA</i>	CHADE JUMAA	5649 BELMONT	48127	4	1	2022
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>VONSEF Frouni</i>	VONSEF Frouni	21321 HICKORYWOOD CT	48127	4	1	22

CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Theresa Koch</i>	Theresa Koch	7561 N Sway Ln	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Mona Beydoun</i>	Mona Beydoun	5770 Rouge Cir	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Adnan Maqani</i>	Adnan Maqani	20327 Ann Arbor Tr	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Ahmad Nasir</i>	Ahmad Nasir	7329 Highview	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Diane Lem</i>	Diane Lem	25944 Kirtin St	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Nazim Sharaf</i>	Nazim Sharaf	17007 W Outer Dr	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Missy Day</i>	Missy Day	25428 New York	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>John Barry Hayes</i>	John Barry Hayes	1115 Orchard Ln	48122	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Marie Clane</i>	Marie Clane	26041 Amphipolis	48122	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>Hassan Mami</i>	Hassan Mami	17487 Outer Dr	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>AMANDA GOZMSKI</i>	AMANDA GOZMSKI	8102 GRAYFIELD	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>EDWARD DAWNER</i>	EDWARD DAWNER	4172 SYRACUSE	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>JUDY STANNEK</i>	JUDY STANNEK	4411 Redwood	48127	4	1	22
CITY OF <input type="checkbox"/> Dearborn Heights	<i>WAYNE FERRELL</i>	WAYNE FERRELL	4701 FLEMING	48127	4	1	22

## Appendix II: List of Circulators Submitting Fraudulent Petitions

The following fraudulent-petition circulators submitted petition sheets across at least 10 campaigns:

Davon Best	Teddrick Lee
Siarra Bergami	Niccolo Mastromatteo
Antonio Braxton	Indira Radcliffe
Brianna Briggs	Aaliyah Render
Charles Calvin	Priya Render
Nicholas Carlton	Indira Roopchard
Jaylynn Casey	Giovannee Smith
DeShawn Evans	Tremari Smith
Jehvon Evans	Ryan Snowden
Justin Garland	Stephen Tinnin
Corey Hampton	Freddie Toliver
Jonell Hampton	Diallo Vaughn
LeVaughn Hearn	Yazmine Vasser
Briana Heron	William Williams
Aaliyah Ingram	
Danyil Lancaster	

The following fraudulent-petition circulators submitted petition sheets for a single campaign:

Charlotte Hanover  
Violet Rose Edwards  
Cory Sims  
Crystal Stephens  
Siarra Brown  
Dashlene Petit Phard